

November 3, 2003

Veteran's Memorial Commission

Proceedings by Authority

State of New York,
City of Jamestown, ss:
Mayor's Conference Room

A regular meeting of the Veteran's Memorial Commission of the City of Jamestown, New York was held on Monday, November 3, 2003 at 5:15 p.m.

Members Present: Chairman David W. Shepherd, Pamela J. Butler, Barclay O. Wellman, John R. Allen, Evelyn S. Adams, Russell E. Diethrick, Jr.

Members Absent: Clyde Card, Craig W. Young, William J. Servis

Others Present: City Clerk Shirley A. Sanfilippo

Chairman Shepherd called the meeting to order.

Mr. Wellman moved to approve the minutes of the preceding meeting, which was seconded by Ms. Butler.

Carried: 6 ayes, 0 nays

FINANCIAL REPORT

Chairman Shepherd reported on the Chautauqua Region Community Foundation's balances. The Maintenance Endowment has \$134.00 available this year. The Pass-through account still has \$4,570.00 available. The ESDC, money that was given to us by Senator McGee, has \$59,841.25 available. We have paid the first installment to Patti McEwin in the amount of \$1,875.00.

OLD BUSINESS

Chairman Shepherd said he has not been able to find better numbers for the killed in action than we had painted on the granite.

Ms. Adams said she is certain there are a larger number than what they have.

Chairman Shepherd said that he has been in touch with the County Historian and the gentleman, who runs the Veteran Memorial at the Lighthouse in Dunkirk, and they don't have any access to better numbers.

Ms. Adams asked what happened to the list that he asked for in 1986 for the Memorial Day program. It was a list of extensive names at that time.

Chairman Shepherd responded that Elizabeth Crocker had control of that list. She was the former County Historian.

Chairman Shepherd said the present Historian told him that some of the information that Ms. Crocker had was kept by her heirs. It was not passed into the hands of the present County Historian.

Ms. Adams said that she kept everything at home. If you ask the War Department for individual names, not by county, they can come up with them for you.

November 3, 2003

Chairman Shepherd said the paint on the banner on the marble is running. One or two of the digits are almost illegible at this stage. He thought it would be good if they would carve the numbers that the initial Commission came up with since we don't seem to be able to find anyway to improve the numbers.

Ms. Adams asked if they wanted the number of individual veterans for each individual war. The Civil War was pretty well documented by that man from Frewsburg and she has that list.

Chairman Shepherd replied that he assumed she gave that number.

Ms. Adams said she didn't think so.

Chairman Shepherd said the Civil War was posted. She was on the Commission and he assumed that the number was as good as she knew to make it. It is not yet carved. He talked to Jensen-Hagland and for \$160.00 they will do it. He expected it to be done by now but doesn't think it is. He can cancel that if anybody thinks that they have some reasonable means of determining a better number. He said he has followed every lead that he has come up with. He inquired what their pleasure was. Should they go ahead and carve the old numbers?

Ms. Adams said she wouldn't because it is wrong. Anybody who knows history would know that those numbers are not right.

Chairman Shepherd said there is just not any historian who knows what numbers are wrong.

Ms. Adams advised to make an appeal to the public, like people at The Post Journal did six to eight years ago. They published the ones we knew about. That list is on the wall in the office.

Ms. Butler said The Post Journal can go across the Southern Tier and they don't want that. They just want Chautauqua County

Ms Adams said this was Chautauqua County because she got the information out of her file. They have found new ones since that list was published. We should appeal to people to call in the names.

Chairman Shepherd said that he doesn't think that would be any more historically accurate than what we have. What we carve will be accepted as fact.

Mr. Diethrick asked if the numbers seem to be way off, say five, ten, or twenty.

Ms. Evelyn feels that it is far off. It is very low. The numbers should be very high for any given war. She was concentrating on the 20th Century wars. She never tried to do more.

Mr. Wellman said he never looked at the numbers.

Ms. Adams said she did know at one time but now she doesn't.

Mr. Wellman asked what it says for World War II.

Chairman Shepherd said he copied the number down in the past but he doesn't have the sheet with him.

Mr. Wellman asked if it is just one period that is in question or all the wars.

November 3, 2003

Chairman Shepherd said it is the number for the Civil War, Spanish War, each one up and through the Persian Gulf War.

Mr. Wellman asked if it is one particular period, like World War II, that is way out?

Chairman Shepherd answered that he doesn't have a sense of that one way or another at all. He just knows that Evelyn thinks the numbers wrong and Rolly has told him that they aren't confident that these were the right numbers so they painted them on rather than carving them.

Mr. Diethrick asked where Rolly got them from.

Chairman Shepherd answered that from discussion and his impression is that they were the best numbers Evelyn could come up with or others that contributed ideas.

Ms. Adams said it is not feasible for World War I, II, and Korea. Some people feel that the Vietnam War had better records kept.

Ms. Butler said it is almost impossible to find out anything prior to 1973 because of the fire in St. Louis where all the records were kept. It is almost impossible.

Mr. Diethrick said at some point in time the Government kept good records.

Chairman Shepherd pointed out that they didn't keep a database that could be sorted by county. They kept the database by state because they would give a home of record and they might be able to say how many people were from Jamestown. They don't say that. They talk about by state.

Chairman Shepherd said that they haven't carved the numbers in yet so it can be stopped but we are going to have to ask someone to paint them on.

Ms. Adams said that it should be done but how, when, and what numbers do we go with. She thinks you are going to get people contradicting historians that know better.

Chairman Shepherd said that what he is hearing is that no one knows better. Some people are making an educated guess that probably these numbers are not accurate.

Ms. Butler made a motion to stop the carving and paint the numbers back on.

Mr. Wellman said that the numbers should be carved in sometime. We need to come up with a time frame and anybody on this Commission or anybody else can research as much as they want but by March 2004 we could go with the numbers that we have. Until that time anyone can use whatever research they want.

Chairman Shepherd asked if anyone wanted to pick it up and go with it to come up and come up with the numbers.

Ms. Adams said they could go up to the Vet's office and ask them if they have some round figure in mind.

Chairman Shepherd said there are round figures on the stone and that is the problem.

Ms. Butler said to document anything from the Civil War is impossible.

Ms. Adams said that Russell Graham from Frewsburg made a list of Civil War people and it is quite complete.

November 3, 2003

Ms. Butler asked what numbers she is questioning that are not right.

Ms. Adams said everyone, the 20th century wars, World War I, II, and Korean.

Mr. Diethrick asked how far off they are? Are we off by 200 or 2000?

Ms. Adams said some of the numbers on some of the wars are only two digits numbers. We know there is more.

Ms. Butler said that we don't know that.

Ms. Adams said that she can tell them how many she has received information on that are in Chautauqua County.

Mr. Diethrick asked, if they don't agree with the numbers that are out there, how were the numbers out there picked in the last Commission?

Ms. Adams said to ask Rolly and he will tell you that it was just an estimate.

Chairman Shepherd said that was right but someone came up with some numbers. Rolly doesn't know what any of the numbers were except for Persian Gulf I.

Ms. Adams said between Jim Westman, Rolly, and Phil Rose, they just came up with the numbers.

Chairman Shepherd said one or more people advised them on the numbers because they wouldn't have made them up. It was the best numbers that the Commission could come up with. He cannot find anybody who can improve on the numbers or had any means of digging them out.

Ms. Adams said there are people who are in the County office, like the clerk, don't want to take the time to go through the number of discharges. The killed in action people were not issued a discharged. When every veteran came out of the service, they were told to go register their discharge with the County seat.

Chairman Shepherd and Mrs. Butler stated that now they are told not to.

Mr. Diethrick asked if there was any way to put an asterisk on the marble and a note saying it is an estimated number.

Chairman Shepherd said we can pay to carve the best guess in there. He would like to get the best number he can.

Mr. Allen asked if it was necessary to have the numbers out there.

Chairman Shepherd said the declared purpose of the outside memorial was to give people a sense of the sacrifice and contribution that local people made in these wars.

Ms. Adams said if she worked on her files for five or six hours, she could sit at the file and draw up those numbers that we have. She has a black line on the top of the cards of every killed in action soldier of any war. Then they can say that is the available estimate. Her files don't include the Spanish American and the Civil War.

Chairman Shepherd asked if she had anybody working with her at this stage

November 3, 2003

Ms. Adams said she has one lady working with her. She does the obituaries as they come up. She did the veterans that are listed in The Post Journal and Dunkirk's for a while.

Mr. Diethrick asked if she could come up with a number of ones she can verify, for what you can verify.

Ms. Adams said that is what she is suggesting. It would take her five or six hours to do it. You do want the Civil War and the Spanish American War.

Chairman Shepherd said the only reason is that is what was done originally. He is willing to accept the numbers. He asked her if the Civil War was a pretty good number.

Ms. Adams said she never counted them up. She had this record that was done by Mr. Graham and it tells sometimes that they were discharged and sometimes they were killed in action. She has to go through and take a number from each of those localities in Chautauqua County. It is just a matter of going through it.

Chairman Shepherd asked if he should get in touch with Jensen-Haglund and suggest that they postpone whatever they were going to do until next construction season. In the mean time we will work a little while on getting better numbers.

Ms. Adams would like to work on it but it is too hard for her in the winter.

Mr. Allen said he would pick her up and bring her home.

Chairman Shepherd said he would get in touch with Jensen-Haglund and postpone it until next spring pending on whatever work can be done to improve the numbers.

Chairman Shepherd said they would take her numbers, defend them, and back her up. They are the best numbers we can do. He stated they would take responsibility for the numbers that are carved.

Chairman Shepherd said he wanted to introduce a topic and go over it so they can get to the computer business. He had asked Al Cala to come up with some numbers for re-finishing the seats, the planters, etc. on the plaza. He has an inventory of the redwood benches and planters here and an estimate of around \$12,000 to rehabilitate them. This would be to disassemble the redwood, sand it down, make it pretty again, put back together, and arrange it around the memorial. In addition to that, there is a suggestion, request, or proposal by the Parks Department that all trash receptacles, planters, and benches conform with the style that is on Third Street. There is an estimate for that number as well. Then thirdly, there is an interest on someone's part for putting some awnings up on the plaza to make it more inviting. Mr. Cala has several proposals on that. What he has told him on it, and we need to discuss, is that he is not sure that he sees any awning structure being germane to the memorial itself and so the money they have will not be appropriately spent on anything like that. We would take it up here and see what we can do.

Mr. Diethrick said that awnings have a high maintenance.

Chairman Shepherd said he wasn't going to go into it tonight. He just wanted to introduce it. He will get a spreadsheet so they can compare it a little better. They will get it out.

Mr. Wellman thinks it is a bad idea.

Ms. Butler said she agreed with that.

November 3, 2003

Chairman Shepherd said he agrees with that too. The thing they need to think about is the difference between rehabilitating redwood around there and the recycled plastic and steel.

City Clerk Sanfilippo said those are the ones the City put up and if they are talking about the new ones than that is not the ones that you are thinking of. The one they are talking about is one that is on the sidewalk, that is black, and it is just a flat bench.

Chairman Shepherd said what appears on Third Street, the style of the trash receptacles, and all is what they are proposing as well. His immediate reaction to that is that we have enough hard surfaces here already with concrete, glass, and stone. It would be good to have some wood, foliage, etc. to soften it up. That is part of what he is looking for. That can be part of our discussion next time.

NEW BUSINESS

Chairman Shepherd said four of them met a month ago and talked about what the website ought to look like and it took awhile to get it done because he kept running into other things. After listening to the discussion they had, he drafted a proposal for the website. He needs to get it to Ms. McEwin as soon as they can, but not before they are satisfied with it. What you see on the front page is a rectangle to indicate that there is a picture of the memorial somehow. This is how we would introduce it. You can double-click on any underlined topics and that is what you would go to. The first question is do they have other areas that they would like to have access to other than the ones that are there? Look at the business about the memorial he drafted, are there any comments or additions needed to be made to that?

They reviewed the draft from Chairman Shepherd

Ms. Adams said that Mayor Kimball meant it to be just Jamestown when he named this Commission. At the suggestion of someone on the Commission, he came to a meeting and he said "I realize now that patriotism knows no boundaries." So therefore, he said they were doing a listing of Chautauqua County veterans.

Chairman Shepherd asked if it should say, in the first sentence, "from our Chautauqua County community"?

They agreed to that wording.

Chairman Shepherd suggested changing the fourth paragraph to say, "the hardware became outdated."

Ms. Adams said what about those that died in combat. Not everyone died in combat.

Chairman Shepherd asked if you didn't die in combat or die as a result of wounds are you considered a KIA.

Ms Adams said this was an issue that this Commission originally discussed and they decided, yes, if you died during your term of enlistment or draft you were KIA.

Chairman Shepherd said you are killed in action if the military says you were killed in action. Take and read this and if you are bothered by something or want to change something, give him a call. City Clerk Sanfilippo did some work for them. On the back of the packets you have, are the Council actions creating the first Ad-Hoc Committee and the names. What he proposes to do is to use the list from the official documents that the City Clerk had printed for them.

Mr. Diethrick said page four said "the original Commission members."

November 3, 2003

City Clerk Sanfilippo said it is on page 138 from the Jamestown June 25, 1995 Council minutes.

Chairman Shepherd said this is a record of who was appointed. Do you want to follow that? Do you want to discuss this?

City Clerk Sanfilippo said these would have been the original members that were first appointed. In 1998 we had two resignations. At that time Kenneth Furlow and Richard Johnson were put on.

Chairman Shepherd proposed to list the people who appear in the documents that we have here. The page that says original Commission members with the list that he made out looking at what he had and talking to Evelyn and Rolly and those are the names he came up with. When he talked with City Clerk Sanfilippo, he asked if there were some official records of it. That is what she has given them. He takes that as being the official record and that is what he will go with. He will have a sheet saying original Commission members but he will amend this list to conform to the list that City Clerk Sanfilippo provided.

They agreed on this.

Chairman Shepherd wanted to take this out of order. The United Veteran's Council wrote to the City Clerk asking about the Veteran's Day ceremonies of Jamestown.

Mr. Diethrick moved to sponsor the Veteran's Day Ceremony, which Ms. Butler seconded.

Carried: 6 ayes, 0 nays

Chairman Shepherd went back to discussing the website and mentioned about the sculptor. Dave Poulan has an official bio and he hasn't gotten it to him yet. He wants to get it electronically because he has to give everything to Ms. McEwin electronically. That is why there isn't anything there but he is going to take what he gives him and that is what will be on this page. There will a picture included on the page. If you click on about the Commission, you get Chapter 82. We need to discuss this and agree on it with a quorum. We decided last time that instead we would just give our names and the dates our terms expire. It will have to be updated. That will be part of the maintenance deal.

City Clerk Sanfilippo said this might be something we can do ourselves.

Chairman Shepherd said about the database. He is not at all confident that he captured everything that was said about it. In the first paragraph he added this last part of the line he underlined and put a question mark on. The only requirement we have set is that the Veterans have a DD-214 from the service. The mechanics of someone else bringing information in, how do we want to handle that?

A discussion was held on how the current information has been collected.

Chairman Shepherd added a field on the Enrollment Form to put in the source of the record. He asked if they want to reconsider what is on the Enrollment Form. They added war and source of record for the facility of searching. We could have active duty, reserve duty to accommodate this area. About the Database, the second paragraph says, "If you are a veteran and would like be listed, just fill out the Enrollment Form and if you click on that, it will take you to the form. We are happy to include you. Also, if you have a relative that is a veteran and is not listed please have them fill out the form, if they are able. If they are not able to fill out the form for any reason, you may do it for them." They do not want to say that. Change to "If you are or know

November 3, 2003

of a relative that is a veteran". If we include source on the Enrollment Form, we could stop with the sentence, "We are happy to include you." He will work on the wording.

Ms. Adams stated that this was a listing of Wartime veterans.

Mr. Diethrick said that this is a Veteran's Memorial, not War or Combat veterans only.

Chairman Shepherd said he was never aware of that distinction, except in discussions. He does not know if the 17,000 are all wartime, to the exclusion of any peacetime veterans. He feels strongly that they should include veterans. In the paperwork he has from the first Commission, it says that two focal points were established for the Memorial. The first was outdoors on Tracy Plaza to call to the sacrifice made in defense of our Nation by those who died in combat. The second focal point was the touch-screen computer that had the names and other facts about Chautauqua County veterans. This database was searchable and allowed the searchers to request a printout. Based on this two-goal purpose and the KIAs are the principal focus of the outside and the total corpus of veterans was the focus of the kiosk. That is his understanding to begin with from his conversation with Rolly and from reading the background material that was given him. So based on that, it was veterans and the reason for it was all the veterans contributed to the spirit of the Country. The point of the declared purpose that he read was that this was part of the service and sacrifice to defend our Country and what it stands for. It wasn't just that you were there when fighting took place that you deserved to be recognized; but, in fact, that you were there prepared to do your duty whenever danger calls. What they are looking at now is, in the page about the database, what are they going to say. They agreed to cross everything out after the sentence "We are happy to include you." They scratched the end of the sentence in the first paragraph "will presently be on active duty" and they are adding "if you are a veteran or if you know of a veteran." They have to have a DD-214 or some thing equivalent. They went over the fields of the database and decided what they wanted for the fields

Ms. Butler asked if they would be liable for the information.

Mr. Diethrick asked who is the highest authority on the Privacy Act. They should protect themselves. He asked if that person should review the document.

Chairman Shepherd said they could run it by the Corporation Counsel. Regarding links they talked about at the last meeting, they agree they would go with the New York State Division of Veteran Affairs. They will show their website, which does a good job of distributing anything else. On how to contact them, he suggested to use the city clerk's email address. City Clerk Sanfilippo gave him a list of 200 names of people that included pictures. They were going to carry over the pictures and not the videos.

Ms. Adams asked if they were going to retain the paragraphs with the pictures. She would like to proofread the paragraphs.

Ms. Butler said, no.

Chairman Shepherd said he would talk to Ms. McEwin on that. He will check on this matter. He will give her a good copy to use for the basis of the web page.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

Shirley A. Sanfilippo, CMC, RMC
City Clerk