

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
1 Municipal Drive
July 13, 2023

Present: Tera Hayward-Olivas, Chairperson
Kevin Wade
Justin Day

Absent: Lisa Doak

Also Present: Leila Hamroun, Architectural Consultant

Ms. Hayward-Olivas convened the meeting at 6:35 p.m. Roll call followed and a quorum to conduct business was declared.

Approval of the Minutes

A motion to postpone approval of the May 9, 2023 and the June 8, 2023, minutes until the August meeting was made, seconded and unanimously carried.

New Business

203 Chestnut Street – Calvin Banning

An application was submitted to remove and replace shingled and flat roof and replace siding on the front of the home. Ms. Hamroun explained that the application was rejected as a Tier 1. The applicant proposed to do roofing and flat roof work and replace the siding on the front of the home with Hardie Plank on a contributing building. The Guidelines state that alternate materials for exterior cladding are not appropriate on elevations visible from the public right-of-way. The roofing was approved as Tier 1; however, the siding was not approved.

Mr. Matt James of Ferris Home Improvements, representing the homeowner, stated that because of issues with wood rotting, they recommended the use Hardie Plank instead of wood. Ms. Hamroun explained that Hardie Plank has been used in the Historic District, but should not be used on elevations visible to the public right-of-way. She added that the front elevation siding must be natural wood. Ms. Hamroun noted that HAC does not consider color or style of the siding.

The application will be modified and resubmitted for Tier 1 review.

106 West 6th Street – Dean Mitchell

An application was submitted to replace eight (8) windows on the side and back of the home. Ms. Hamroun explained that the building is a contributing building and the application was rejected as Tier 1 due to the proposed windows being Fibrex, and fiberglass windows are not appropriate on elevations that are visible from the public right-of-way. She added that the side windows are visible from the public right-of-way.

Mr. Dillon Griffith from Renewal By Anderson, representing the homeowner, stated that although the windows are called “Fibrex”, it is not actually fiberglass, but is a wood composite.

Mr. Griffith distributed documentation on the proposed windows to the Commission members. Ms. Hamroun noted that the material is an extrusion and is not an engineered wood. There is some wood material in the composite, but it is not wood. Mr. Griffith presented a sample of the proposed window and explained the construction, noting that it will last longer than wood. Ms. Hayward-Olivas stated that a wood window that is well-maintained and painted will last. Ms. Hamroun stated that although it is a nice Fibrex window and the fact that there is some wood binder in the extrusion, it is still an extruded material; and it is not a window that is appropriate for being visible from the public right-of-way. Ms. Hamroun also noted that a wood clad window is also not appropriate if visible from the public right-of-way.

Ms. Hamroun stated that Fibrex windows would be acceptable on the rear elevation but not for the side elevation. Ms. Hamroun and Mr. Bergstrom will inspect the side windows to determine if the Fibrex windows are or are not visible from the public right-of-way.

The application will be modified and resubmitted for Tier 1 review.

Mr. Mitchell asked for a clarification of the term “historic” and discussion of the Guidelines, the National Historic Landmark District, the National Historic Register, the Historic District, the process followed when drafting the Guidelines, and why his home is considered to be in the Historic District ensued.

Consultation

105 The Strand – Patrick Pinnell & Kathleen Curran

An application was submitted for consultation for a proposed new build at 105 The Strand.

Mr. Pinnell gave the Commission members background on he and his wife and how they came to relocate to New Castle. Mr. Pinnell explained various aspects of the design and proposed materials.

During the review Ms. Hamroun made a number of suggestions that Mr. Pinnell agreed to revisit, including the elevator, the roofline, skylights on street facing elevations, the number of bays on the front elevation, the basement access stairs, and the rhythm of the street. It was noted that Mr. Pinnell also intends to install solar panels.

Mr. Pinnell thanked the Commissioners for their input and stated that he would revisit the suggestions that were made.

Miscellaneous

Mr. Wade expressed his desire to discuss gas pipes and regulators in the Historic District. Ms. Hayward-Olivas noted that topic was not part of the Agenda and recommended that it be added to the August meeting Agenda to make the public aware of what is being discussed. Mr. Wade stated that he has given the placement of the gas pipes and regulators a considerable amount of thought and that for the integrity of the Commission the HAC should have a voice that is advised to the Council on the its position to make them less intrusive.

Historic Area Commission Minutes
July 13, 2023

There being no further business to discuss, Ms. Hayward-Olivas called for a motion to adjourn.

A motion to adjourn was made, seconded and unanimously carried, and the meeting adjourned at 8:04 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathleen R. Weirich
City Stenographer