

The City Council met in regular session in the Council Chambers on Wednesday, September 7, 2016 at 9:00 A.M.

Council Members present, Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.

On motion of Mr. Winarski, Seconded by Mrs. Arrington, the reading of the minutes of the Meeting of August 17, 2012 were dispensed with and same adopted with copies furnished to the members of City Council by yeas Council Members Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski, Witherspoon and Merski. 7. Nays. 0.

Copies of the bills under date of September 2, 2016, September 9, 2016 were given to City Council and same adopted by yeas Council Members Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski, Witherspoon and Merski. 7. Nays. 0.

---

By Mr. Kwitowski, Council File No.15, 965

An ordinance in accordance with the City of Erie budget appropriating the sum of \$13,789.79 from unappropriated and anticipated revenue for use by the City of Erie Fire Department. These funds were received via a contribution from the PA State Fire Commissioners Fixed Asset Program.

September 7, 2016. City Council on motion of Mr. Kwitowski, Seconded by Mr. Brennan having read Council File No. 15,965, does hereby adopt on First Reading by yeas Council Members Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski, Witherspoon and Merski. 7. Nays 0.

September 7, 2016, Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mr. Jones, Seconded by Mr. Kwitowski, Resolved, etc.

That the proper City officials are authorized and directed to file a [Renewal](#) Application with the Pennsylvania Liquor Control Board for the purpose of exempting the areas identified as Zone 1 (Cranberry Street to Parade Street, North edge of Second Street to the Water's Edge) and Zone 2 (Holland Street to Peach Street, Fourteenth Street north to northern edge of Second Street) on the map attached hereto as Exhibit A from 47P.S 493.34 regarding amplified music being heard off-premises. Council authorized the initial application by resolution of March 8, 2006 and renewed again on April 15, 2009 and March 21, 2012. This Renewal Application shall be for a 3-year period if the Board approves. The City will enforce its own Noise Control ordinance at Article 705 of the Codified Ordinances.

September 7, 2016. City Council adopt by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.

September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mr. Witherspoon, Seconded by Mr. Kwitowski, Resolved etc.

That the proper City Officials are hereby authorized and directed to enter into a contract extension with [Building Inspection Underwriters](#) of Pennsylvania, Inc., 4538 Peach Street, Erie, PA 16509, at the current rates, for inspection services for the City of Erie's rental program through March 2017.

September 7, 2016. City Council adopt by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Winarski and Witherspoon. 6. Nays, Kwitowski. 1.

September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mr. Brennan, Seconded by Mr. Witherspoon, Resolved, etc.

**Partnering with the Erie County for a Regional Transportation System 8/30/16**  
Revised (9/6/16)

**WHEREAS**, the City of Erie and Erie County governments continue their historical partnerships of major regional assets, including the Erie Regional Airport Authority and Erie County Convention Center Authority; and

**WHEREAS**, the City of Erie believes a regional approach to transportation in partnership with Erie County, is in the best interest of all citizens now and in the future; and

**WHEREAS**, the Erie City Council of the Erie County seeks an amended EMTA charter agreement between the City of Erie and Erie County governmental units, which should include the following amendments:

1. The Charter shall take effect on September 15, 2016, and expire on September 14, 2036, making the length of the new charter 20 years.
2. The Board will be comprised of 5 appointees from City Council and 4 appointees from County Council.
3. Erie County Council's appointees will be appointed at their discretion without advice or consent by the Erie County Executive.
4. Erie City Council's appointments will be appointed at their discretion without advice or consent by the Mayor of the City of Erie.
5. Article V – Board Composition (Revised):
  - a. New Board appointments will be made upon acceptance by the City and County of all amendments to the Charter and subsequent renewal of the Charter.
  - b. The Board shall be composed of 9 appointees by the Erie City Council and Erie County Council and shall serve five (5) year terms as required by the Municipality Authorities Act.
6. Regarding financing of the EMTA, all member municipalities currently paying funds towards EMTA will remain at the same rate of funding, pending evaluation and possible recommendations by the new EMTA Board.
7. Since 40% of the Erie County population resides within the City of Erie, the City's contribution will be 40% of the remaining local match, and 60% will be the County's contribution.
8. The EMTA by-laws shall be amended to include language that a complete financial statement will be available to all Board members, and provided to the County of Erie and City of Erie, at each Board meeting.
9. All EMTA subcommittees shall have a minimum of one appointment from the County of Erie and the City of Erie, and appointment to these subcommittees should reflect the background and skill of said member.
10. The new EMTA Charter will allow for the creation of a Rider's Advisory Council to provide additional feedback to EMTA. The members of the Advisory Council will consist of one member representing Voices for Independence, All Aboard Erie, a student rider from Mercyhurst University North East, a student rider from Edinboro University, a student rider from Penn State-Behrend, and a student rider from the School District of the City of Erie, one at large member nominated by the County Executive and one at large member nominated by the Mayor of the City of Erie. The deliberations and decisions of the Rider's Advisory Council will be non-binding.

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, by Erie City Council, declares its intent to support an amended EMTA Charter which contains the above amendments and all other updated language appropriate to a 2016 through 2036 Charter. Erie County Council is hereby respectfully urged to approve this amended Charter containing this compromise language

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, Erie City Council authorizes and directs the City Solicitor to cease its current legal action against the County of Erie.

September 7, 2016. City Council failed to adopt by yeas Council Members, Arrington, Brennan, and Witherspoon. 3. Nays. 4. Merski, Jones, Kwitowski and Winarski.  
September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mr. Kwitowski, Seconded by Mr. Merski, Resolved, etc.

That the following amounts are transferred in the 2016 Police General Fund Account

| Transferred from: |                    |                       | Transferred to: |                    |                    |
|-------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Amount            | Account            | Title                 | Amount          | Account            | Title              |
| \$ 6,000.00       | 002-0613-0000-4059 | Other Svcs. & Charges | \$ 6,000.00     | 002-0613-0000-4041 | Professional Svcs. |

September 7, 2016. City Council adopt by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.  
 September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mr. Merski, Seconded by Mr. Winarski, Resolved, etc.

That the Mayor and City Controller are authorized and directed to execute contracts between the City of Erie and the following individuals and/or companies for goods and/or services as noted and the City Council do hereby ratify and confirm the said transactions which are to be charged to the respective Budget Code Numbers, viz:

- Tree Removal 2016 Curb Ramps I**, be and the same is hereby awarded to **Walter's Tree and Stump Removal** 5214 Lake Pleasant Road, Erie, PA in the sum of \$4,845.00.
- Proposed Concrete Curb and Sidewalk South Side of South Park Row from State to Peach Bid No. 1731-16**, be and the same is hereby awarded to **Vavala Concrete Construction LLC** 2059 West 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Erie, PA 16502 in the sum of \$65,988.20, they being the lowest of three (3) bids:  
 Amendola Development \$66,736.70  
 Blue Rock \$121,248.00
- 2016 Curb Ramps IV Project, Bid 1730-16**, be and the same is hereby awarded to **Amendola Development CO., Inc.**, 4153 Feidler Drive, Erie, PA 16506, in the amount of \$65,023.20, they being the lowest of five (5) bidders:  
 Mayer Brothers Construction \$90,876.50  
 Vavala Concrete \$91,169.10  
 Guzik Concrete \$92,037.00  
 Russell Standard \$93,811.89  
 Blue Rock Construction \$98,614.56
- Sodium Chloride (road salt) for the 2016-17** season through the Pennsylvania Department of General Services COSTARS Program at the base unit of \$44.78 per ton delivered. The term of the contract runs through July 31, 2017.
- A concessionaire agreement** between the City of Erie and **Mark Needham** with regard to Downing Golf Course as required by the Pennsylvania Liquor Control Board.

September 7, 2016. City Council adopt by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.  
 September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.

By Mrs. Arrington, Seconded by Mr. Winarski, Resolved, etc.

That the Purchasing Agent is authorized and directed to issue purchase orders to the following individuals and/or companies for goods and/or services as noted and the City Council does hereby ratify and confirm the said transactions which are to be charged to the respective Budget Code Numbers, viz:

- Shaffer Technology**, 1001 State Street, Suite 1400 Erie, PA 16501 for one (1) year renewal support of Laserfiche Document Management System Support for the Office of Computer Services for the City of Erie at a cost of \$5,720.00.
- Dival Safety and Supplies**, 1721 Niagara Street, Buffalo, NY 14207 for a Scoot Drive Away Camera used to detect hot spots due to fires for the Bureau of Fire of the City of Erie at a cost of \$9,630.00.
- W.T Spaeder**, 1607 East 18<sup>th</sup> Street, Erie, PA 16514 in the amount of \$2,929.66 to replace booster boiler with hot water system at the Municipal Building, 626 State Street, Erie, PA 16501.
- Renick Brothers Mechanical Contractors**, PO Box 94, 434 Grove City Rd., Slippery Rock, PA 16057 in the amount of \$4,106.00 to replace motor in air handler at the Municipal Building, 626 State Street, Erie, PA 16501.

5. **Lindenmeyr & Munroe**, 1005 Beaver Avenue, Pittsburgh, PA 15233 for two (2) skids of Tidal Express Paper for the Police Department and Print Shop for the City of Erie at a total cost of \$2,552.00.
6. **Pitney Bowes**, P.O. Box 371887, Pittsburgh, PA 15250-7887 for a five (5) year lease agreement for a Relay 500 Inserting System for the Print Shop for the City of Erie at a total cost of \$9,588.00/year.
7. **Athletic Field Pros.** P.O. Box 373, West Pittsburgh, PA 16060, in the amount of \$4,200.00 for field dirt.
8. **Sunnking, Inc.** 4 Owens Road, Brockport, NY 14420 in the amount of \$2,477.20 for Electronic Recycling.
9. **A&H Equipment Co.**, 1124 McLaughlin Road, Bridgeville, PA 15017 for five (5) [salt brine tanks](#) for the Bureau of Streets at a price of \$1,875.00 each for a total cost of \$9,375.00.
10. **Golden Equipment Co.**, P.O. Box 873, 393 Mars Valencia Road, Mars, PA 16046 for liners for a sweeper for the Bureau of Streets at a cost of \$3,861.60.
11. **Groff Tractor & Equipment, Inc.**, 6779 Carlisle Pike, Mechanicsburg, PA 17050, for a front idler and drive wheel for the Milling machine for the Bureau of Streets, at a cost of \$2,698.39.
12. **Admar Supply Company**, 30014 West 17<sup>th</sup> Street, Erie, PA 16505 for the purchase of a 25KVA portable generator for use at the Wastewater Treatment Plant for the Bureau of Sewers at a total cost of \$7,500.00
13. **Process & Data Automation, Inc.**, 5451 Merwin Lane, Suite 100, Erie, PA 16510 for the purchase and installation of Network Address Translation ([NAT](#)) devices for three (3) centrifuges at the Wastewater Treatment Plant for the Bureau of Sewers at a total cost of \$13,940.00.
14. **Walsh Equipment**, 796 Unionville Road, Prospect, PA 16052 for a [JCB Loadall](#) Tele-handler for use at the Wastewater Treatment Plant for the Bureau of Sewers at a total amount of \$129,999.90.
15. **Ronan, Inc.**, 28209 Avenue Stanford, Valencia, CA 91355 the service and repair of the [Incinerator Cake Weight](#) Scale at the Wastewater Treatment Plant for the Bureau of Sewers at a total amount of \$5,361.00
16. **Erie Bearings Co.**, 1432 East 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Erie, PA 16503 for a 30 HP Variable Drive for Centrifuge [Pump #1](#) at the Wastewater Treatment Plant for the Bureau of Sewers for the City of Erie at a total cost of \$2,2778.46.
17. **HANES Supply, Inc.**, 55 James E. Casey Drive, Buffalo, NY 142069, for 300 safety vests for all departments @ \$17.50 each for the Department of Risk Management of the City of Erie at a cost of \$5,250.00.
18. **Tom Keenan**, 3111 Patio Drive, Erie, PA 16506 for the Summer Recreations, J.C Martin Golf Course Youth Clinics for the Bureau of Parks, Department of Public Works of the City of Erie at a total cost of \$2,750.00.

September 7, 2016. City Council adopt by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones, Kwitowski, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.  
 September 7, 2016. Signed by the President. Attested by the City Clerk.



# City of Erie

## Attachment to 2017 Minimum Municipal Obligation

To be presented to City Council

The Minimum Municipal Obligation for the pension plans of the City of Erie is being certified with City Council. This procedure is required under Act 205 which pertains to the funding requirements of State Regulated Employee Retirement Programs.

The 2017 Minimum Municipal Obligation, including \$680,160 for the portion paid by the Erie City Water Authority, totals \$14,350,614. The City of Erie portion of the 2017 Minimum Municipal Obligation is \$1,716,560 more than the 2016 Minimum Municipal Obligation. Approximately \$541,000 of the increase is a result of a rate of return on the actuarial value of the plan assets that was less than the assumed rate. The plans assume an 8% rate of return; however, the actuarial value of assets is credited with only a 7% rate of return under the Act 44 asset smoothing technique. It will continue this way until the market value of assets surpasses the actuarial value of assets. The balance of the increase in the Minimum Municipal Obligation is a result of actuarial experience different than plan assumptions.

The 2017 Minimum Municipal Obligation is the first MMO that has been prepared using the results of the January 1, 2015 actuarial valuations.

Respectfully submitted,

Teresa Stankiewicz, City Controller

## Office of City Controller

Teresa Stankiewicz, Controller  
626 State Street Rm 302 • Erie PA 16501-1128  
Voice 814.870.1339 • Fax 814.870.1413 • [tstankiewicz@erie.pa.us](mailto:tstankiewicz@erie.pa.us)



**CITY OF ERIE EMPLOYEES PENSION PLANS  
2017 MINIMUM MUNICIPAL OBLIGATION**

**A. Actuarial Valuation Report**

**B. Development of Minimum Municipal Obligation**

|   | (Erie)<br>O & E<br>Pension<br>Plan | (Water)<br>O & E<br>Pension<br>Plan | (Total)<br>O & E<br>Pension<br>Plan | Police<br>Pension<br>Plan | Firefighters<br>Pension<br>Plan | Total        |
|---|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------|
|   | 1/1/2015                           | 1/1/2015                            | 1/1/2015                            | 1/1/2015                  | 1/1/2015                        | 1/1/2015     |
| 1. Total Projected Annual Payroll                             | \$17,764,563                       | \$295,745                           | \$18,060,308                        | \$13,542,842              | \$10,666,232                    | \$42,269,382 |
| 2. Normal Cost Percentage                                     | 9.7773%                            | 6.3533%                             | 9.7245%                             | 12.1717%                  | 13.8114%                        |              |
| 3. Total Projected Normal Cost<br>(Item 1 x Item 2)           | \$1,736,895                        | \$19,381                            | \$1,756,276                         | \$1,648,394               | \$1,473,156                     | \$4,877,826  |
| 4. Total Amortization Requirement                             | \$1,697,342                        | \$669,217                           | \$2,366,559                         | \$4,991,102               | \$4,484,949                     | \$11,842,610 |
| 5. Total Administrative Expenses                              | \$88,328                           | \$10,785                            | \$99,113                            | \$119,903                 | \$40,483                        | \$259,499    |
| 6. Total Financial Requirements<br>(Item 3 + Item 4 + Item 5) | \$3,522,565                        | \$699,383                           | \$4,221,948                         | \$6,759,399               | \$5,998,588                     | \$16,979,935 |
| 7. Projected Member Contributions                             | \$1,154,697                        | \$19,223                            | \$1,173,920                         | \$813,831                 | \$641,570                       | \$2,629,320  |
| 8. Funding Adjustment   | \$0                                | \$0                                 | \$0                                 | \$0                       | \$0                             | \$0          |
| 9. Minimum Municipal Obligation<br>(Item 6 - Item 7 - Item 8) | \$2,367,868                        | \$680,160                           | \$3,048,028                         | \$5,945,568               | \$5,357,018                     | \$14,350,614 |
| 10. Delinquent MMO Plus Interest                              | \$0                                | \$0                                 | \$0                                 | \$0                       | \$0                             | \$0          |
| 11. Total Minimum Municipal Obligation<br>(Item 9 + Item 10)  | \$2,367,868                        | \$680,160                           | \$3,048,028                         | \$5,945,568               | \$5,357,018                     | \$14,350,614 |

**C. Amortization Contribution Reduction**  
(Complete if Amortization Contribution Reduction was elected)

|   |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 1. Reduction of Amortization Contribution                             |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2. Re-Calculated Minimum Municipal Obligation<br>(Item B11 - Item C1) |  |  |  |  |  |

Certification of Chief Administrative Officer: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: August 31, 2016

Pension Coordinator: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 8-31-16

Date Prepared: September, 2016

September 7, 2016, City Council on motion of Mr. Brennan, Seconded by Mr. Kwitowski; Adjourned at 10:37 A.M. by yeas Council Members Merski, Arrington, Brennan, Jones and Kwitowski, Winarski and Witherspoon. 7. Nays. 0.

\_\_\_\_\_  
President of City Council

Attest: \_\_\_\_\_  
City Clerk