

Lancaster, New York  
**MEETING MINUTES**  
 Thursday, August 4, 2011

**I. Attendance / Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 8:00 by Chairman Meyer

Alternates:

Grocott, S.	<u>exc.</u>	1. Kwiatek, R.	<u>x</u>
Harnack, W., V. Chair	<u>exc.</u>	2. Hassett, J.	<u>x</u>
Meyer, M., Chair	<u>x</u>	Pease, G.	<u>exc.</u> (Bldg. Dept.)
Miller, G., Secretary	<u>x</u>	Stribing, J.	<u>exc.</u> (Village Bd. Liaison)

Roll call indicated that four (4) members were present and a quorum of four (4) existed.

**II. Public Hearings:****A. 18 Church / Barrey/ Porch**

**Background:** The 1986 and 2009 Historic Structure Inventory Forms indicate that this property is two-story "Princess Anne" style home with an L shaped façade and wrap around hip-roofed porch supported by Doric columns with a pediment over the stairs. The 1986 form photo shows a non-original paneled rail around the porch, which has since been removed. The owner described a very early photo of the home that shows no railing on the porch at all, and noted that the columns are of barrel stave construction and are now deteriorated on the bottom.

**A. Porch:**

**Proposed:** The owner will install a new porch that includes various decorative elements.

**Findings:** Although no specific documentary evidence exists for the original architectural features of this property's porch, the proposal is based on extensive research and consultation with professionals in the field of architecture, and the proposed decorative elements are correct for the period and style of the property. Therefore, the alteration is appropriate for this historic property and will improved the appearance of the property in the context of the Historic Preservation District.

**B. Floor:**

**Proposed:** The existing deteriorated wood floor will be replaced in kind with tongue and groove wood, or replaced with a composite and painted.

**Findings:** Painted composite is an appropriate replacement material for the porch floor of this historic property to prevent repeated deterioration and will have minimal impact on the historic appearance of the property.

**C. Columns:**

**Proposed:** The Doric columns with raised bases will be repaired if possible. Replacements, if necessary, will match the existing columns and be wood, if available, or fiberglass.

**Findings:** Fiberglass is an appropriate replacement material in this case if matching wood columns are unavailable.

**D. Balusters, trellises and skirting:**

**Proposed:** The north and south sides of the porch will feature painted wood trellis walls with oval window openings, from a period design by architect Calvert Vaux

(1824-1895). The painted wood balusters will be any one of three designs that have been determined to be appropriate for the period and style of the house, and will be the historically accurate height. The porch skirting will be painted ventilated board and batten.

**Findings:** The proposed balusters, trellises and skirting are an appropriate improvement to this historic property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District. The balusters must meet code approval for height.

**E. Stairs and Railings:**

**Proposed:** The replacement stairs are wood and the railings will be wooden and match the balusters, or will be metal pipe.

**Findings:** The proposed stairs and railing are an appropriate improvement to this historic property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District.

**F. Door:**

**Proposed:** The owner will replace a damaged lite in the original front door with plain glass surrounded by a frame of stained glass squares to match the window in the stairwell.

**Findings:** The proposed window is an appropriate improvement to this historic property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District.

MOTION: Hassett: To approve the design with the following CONDITIONS:  
The balusters must meet code approval for height as presented. Seconded by Miller.  
MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of four (4) to zero (0). Carried.

---

**B. 5654 Broadway / Yavicoli / Porch**

**Background:** The 1986 and 2009 Historic Structure Inventory Forms indicate that this property is distinctive in the Historic Preservation District as an American Foursquare double house, however significant alterations to the original porch have been documented. The property owner indicates that the property was built in 1910 according to his deed, and was originally sided with cedar clapboard, as evidenced by the existence of the original siding beneath the existing asbestos siding, and that the three doors on the façade are not original and do not match each other.

**1. PORCH:**

**Proposed:** The owner will remove the deteriorated existing, non-original, two-story porch and replace with a single story porch with a roof over the entrance, which will also serve as a balcony for the upper second story.

**Findings:** The proposed alteration maintains the original purpose of the property as a double house while improving its appearance in the context of the Historic Preservation District.

**A. Columns:**

**Proposed:** The columns will be wood and match the existing columns, but with the proposed stone-stacked skirting material extended up to the level of the railing at either side of the steps.

**Findings:** Although the porch has undergone extensive alteration from its original appearance, extending the skirting material up to the level of the railing on the columns is not appropriate for the historic American Foursquare design of the home, and would give the home a false Craftsman-style appearance that conflicts with its historic appearance. Therefore, the columns must extend to the porch floor.

#### **B. Balusters:**

**Proposed:** The new balusters will be of painted wood.

**Findings:** The proposed railings are an appropriate improvement to the property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District.

#### **C. Skirting:**

**Proposed:** The porch skirting will be replaced with stacked stone, sided to match the façade, or made of cement block to match the existing foundation.

**Findings:** The proposed alterations to the porch skirting are an appropriate improvement to the property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District.

#### **D. Cheek walls:**

**Proposed:** The existing two-by-four handrails will be replaced with cheek walls. The material of the cheek walls will match the porch skirting.

**Findings:** The proposed cheek walls are an appropriate improvement to the property and improve its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District.

### **2. SIDING:**

**Proposed:** The front will be resided with vinyl siding with corner boards at the edges, with the plan to reside the entire house with vinyl over time.

**Findings:** Vinyl siding is not an appropriate replacement material for this historic property. It may be sided in one of three ways.

A. The existing cement board siding may be repaired in kind.

B. The original cedar clapboard may be exposed, restored and painted, or the existing siding may be replaced with new painted or stained cedar clapboard.

C. The existing siding may be replaced with “Hardie Board” fiber cement clapboard (or similar Product) to match the original cedar clapboard, with a corner board at the edges.

### **3. DOORS:**

**Proposed:** The upper door will be replaced with a single wood, full divided lite “French” door. The lower pair of doors will be replaced with matching new wood oval leaded glass doors, or replaced in kind to match the wagon wheel existing replacement door.

**Findings:** The wood full divided lite balcony door is an appropriate improvement to the property and improves its appearance within the context of the Historic Preservation District. The proposed oval lite in the lower doors is not appropriate to the style and period of the house, but a rectangular leaded glass lite would be appropriate. Replacement in kind to match the existing door with wagon wheel, while not ideal historical design, is an appropriate rehabilitation approach for this property. Therefore the lower doors may be matching wood rectangular or wagon wheel doors.

MOTION: Kwiatek: To approve as presented with the following CONDITIONS:

1. The columns will be wood and match the existing columns and extend to the floor.
2. Vinyl siding is not permitted. The façade may be sided in one of three ways:
  - A. The existing cement board siding may be repaired in kind.
  - B. The original cedar clapboard may be exposed, restored and painted, or the existing siding may be replaced with new painted or stained cedar clapboard.
  - C. The existing siding may be replaced with “Hardie Board” fiber cement clapboard (or similar Product) to match the original cedar clapboard, with a corner board at the edges.
3. The lower doors will be replaced with matching wood rectangular or wagon wheel lite doors.

Seconded by Miller.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of four (4) to zero (0). Carried.

---

### C. 14 St Joseph / Armatys / Fence

**Background:** The 2009 Historic Structure Inventory Form indicates that this property is a hipped roof cottage with various alterations to its original design, and a significant feature within the streetscape of St. Joseph Street.

**Proposed:** The owner will remove the existing wood stockade fence in the back yard and replace it with a wood “dog-eared” profile fence.

**Findings:** The proposed alteration is appropriate for the property and improves its appearance in the context of the Historic Preservation District.

MOTION: Kwiatek: To approve as presented. Seconded by Miller.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of four (4) to zero (0). Carried.

### III. Approval of meeting minutes: none

### IV. Administrative Matters

#### A.) Communications/Reports:

#### B.) Public Comment on Matters of Interest: tabled

1. Ongoing Property issues: Pease (not present)

### IV. Old Business:

- A. Historic District Property List: completed and distributed

### VII. Next Meetings:

Lancaster Historic Preservation Commission  
Lancaster, New York

5

September 14, 2011

October 12, 2011

November 9, 2011

**VIII. Adjourn:**

MOTION: Miller: To adjourn. Seconded by Meyer.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of four (4) to zero (0). Carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Grace M. Miller, Secretary and Board Member