

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
New Castle Town Hall
2nd and Delaware Streets
December 12, 2019

Present: Laura Fontana, Chairperson
Bill Walters
Mark Chaump
Marty Wright

Absent: Cynthia Batty
Leila Hamroun, Architectural Consultant

Also Present: Jeff Bergstrom, City Building Inspector

Ms. Fontana convened the meeting at 6:34 p.m. Roll call followed and a quorum to conduct business was declared.

Approval of the Minutes

Ms. Fontana noted two corrections to the November Minutes:

- Page 1: Remove Marty Wright from the list of members present
- Page 2: 6th paragraph, 6th line, 3rd word: Change “rear” to “front”

A Motion to approve the Minutes of the November 14, 2019, meeting as amended was made and seconded. Mr. Wright was not present at the November 14, 2019, meeting, and abstained from voting. On vote, the Motion was approved with three in favor and one Commissioner abstaining.

NEW APPLICATIONS

167 East 2nd Street – Peter and Gina Beckmeyer

The Application presented is proposing the removal and replacement of 10 windows. Ms. Fontana noted that neither Ms. Hamroun nor the Applicants were present at the meeting; however, as a quorum was present, the Commission would be able to discuss Application and make a determination. Ms. Fontana stated that the property is a corner property bordered by Chestnut Street, 2nd Street, and an unnamed street to the rear, as well as a parking lot. During discussion, it was determined that the property has primary right-of-way on all four sides. The Commission was advised that the proposed replacement windows are vinyl. Ms. Fontana further clarified that the pictures attached to the Application were samples of the windows, and did not depict the actual property.

During discussion Mr. Walters asked if the Historic Area Commission’s intent is to replicate and save the architectural detail on Tier 1, or provide leeway with a combination of wood/vinyl windows. Ms. Fontana stated that the subject property is a contributing building in the Historic District with primary right-of-way views from all sides, and vinyl windows are not acceptable, and that determination coincides with an email received from

Ms. Hamroun with the recommendation that the Application be denied. Ms. Fontana read an excerpt from Ms. Hamroun's email into the Record:

Proposed work does not conform with HAC Guidelines & Standards.

The use of vinyl windows is not appropriate as replacement windows in the historic district on elevations visible from the public right-of-way (page 108 of the guidelines).

The fact that existing windows may be vinyl does not change the finding that new replacement vinyl windows are not appropriate.

After discussion, Ms. Fontana recommended that the Application be declined with recommendations, and a letter be sent to the Applicants explaining the decision with the recommendation that if they wish to replace the windows with all wood windows, their Application could be Tier 1 and would not need to come before HAC again.

Mr. Walters expressed his concern that the homeowner is required to install wood windows which are more expensive than vinyl or a combination of wood/vinyl. Ms. Fontana explained that wood windows are appropriate in the Historic District because they age naturally. She added that alternate materials are appropriate in areas of secondary right-of-way, and that alternative materials have been approved in the Historic District in cases where the area is not visible from the public (primary) right-of-way.

A Motion to decline the Application as submitted with vinyl windows was made, with the recommendation that if the homeowner uses wood windows, the Application can be resubmitted for Tier 1 approval. The Motion was seconded and on vote, was approved unanimously.

COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Mr. Chaump asked Mr. Bergstrom if the City provided consultations to homeowners requesting historic review, and Mr. Bergstrom explained that he and Ms. Hamroun conduct consultations with homeowners who are requesting changes to residences in the Historic District.

Ms. Fontana stated that pursuant to Code §230-52, a letter will be sent to the homeowner of 167 East 2nd Street with an explanation of the Commission's decision to decline with recommendation.

Ms. Fontana asked if a draft of the revised Application would be available at the January 2020 meeting, and Mr. Bergstrom advised that he thought the draft would be ready to present to the Commissioners in January.

Historic Area Commission Minutes
December 12, 2019

There being no further comments from the Commissioners and no further business to discuss, Ms. Fontana called for a Motion to Adjourn.

A Motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:57 p.m. was made, seconded and unanimously approved.

Kathy Weirich
Stenographer